Evansville Historic Preservation Commission

**Minutes**

**Wednesday, May 18, 2016, 6:30 P.M.**

**Evansville City Hall**

**Present:** Betsy Ahner, Steve Christens, Steve Culbertson, John Decker, Matt Koser Ald. Gene Lewis, and Dan Stephans.

**Absent:**  None.

**Also Present:**  Community Development Director Jason Sergeant, citizens Sharon Cybart. Lyman Fuson, Andy Phillips, Mike Doverspike, Scott Vale, Rachel Guzman, Gary Haefer, and Lewis Lissner.

**Call to order.** The meeting was called to order at 6:31 PM by Chair Culbertson.

**Approval of minutes.** Koser moved to waive reading and to approve the minutes of the April 20, 2016 minutes, with two corrections to be supplied by the Community Development Director. Stephans seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote.

**Civility reminder.**  Announced by the Chair.

**Citizen appearances.** Sharon Cybart and Lyman Fusonshared with the Commission their intentions with respect to rehabilitation of their residence on West Main Street. The Commission observed that a building permit is not required for painting, and that color choices are entirely up to the property owner. Repainting and other restoration work on historic properties is eligible for historic preservation income tax credits for projects that are approved in advance by the State Historic Preservation Officer. The owners were referred to Jennifer Davel of the SHPO staff and to Community Development Director Sergeant for additional technical advice.

**New business**

 Sergeant noted that Commission members and staff have been invited to a reception at the Eager Economy Building on June 3 to observe the recognition by the National Trust for Historic Preservation of the restoration project.

**Applications.**

1. 318-320 W. Main Street, John and Nelson Winston Double House, 1858 Greek Revival, AHI 84967. Andy Phillips appeared in support of a demolition permit application. The frame structure sustained severe fire damage. Pursuant to Wis. Stat. sec. 66.0413 the Commission applied the statutory formula to evaluate the reasonableness of the cost of returning the building to code-compliant condition vs. the value of the improvement prior to the casualty. The assessed value of $105,100 divided by the ratio of assessed value to the recommended value as last published by the department of revenue for Evansville (1.0250) is $102,500. (This figure is also the “estimated fair market value, as listed on the tax bill, of which the Commission takes official notice.) Eighty-five percent of this figure is $87,125. The Commission concludes as a matter of law that the cost of repairing the structure far exceeds $87,125, and that the cost of repair is unreasonable within the meaning of the statute.

Decker moved to approve issuance of a demolition permit. Koser seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote. The Commission asked Sergeant to formally advise the State Historic Preservation Officer at the earliest opportunity to begin the statutory 30-day inspection period, and advised that demolition may not commence until the time period has elapsed or has been waived by SHPO. The Commission also noted that demolition is authorized but not required by issuance of the permit, and that the owner may still rehabilitate the structure if that is his preference.

1. 318-322 W. Main Street. Andy Phillips appeared in support of design review approval of two proposed duplex residences, each with detached two-car garages, to be constructed to replace the damaged double house. Issuance of conditional use permits by the Plan Commission will be required for this proposed project to take place. To expedite the approval process, the Commission reviewed plan views and elevations of the proposed new construction. Preliminary review shows that the proposed work will likely meet all requirements for infill construction in the Historic District. Stephans moved to recommend the proposed concept to the Plan Commission. Christens seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote.
2. 18 W. Main Street, William H. Van Hise Building, 1871 Boomtown, AHI 85199. Mike Doverspike appeared in support of an amended application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Transite panels will be removed from the 2nd floor residential portion of the building on the front façade only and will be replaced by fiber cement board clapboards. Cornice, window hoods, and other wood trim on the front façade will be repainted. Wood clapboards on the 1st floor storefront will also be replaced with fiber cement board products. The owner advises that no original wood siding remains on the building. Ahner moved to approve the application as submitted. Stephans seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote.
3. 27 Garfield Avenue, house, Gabled Ell built between 1891 and 1907, AHI 85062. Scott Vale and Rachel Guzman appeared in support of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. The house is sided with aluminum, which is deteriorating and damaged in places. Vinyl siding will be used to replace the aluminum, with vinyl shake material to be applied at the gable ends. The original wood siding beneath the aluminum will be retained, and the vinyl will be the same as the vinyl siding recently approved for the new garage on the site. Decker moved to approve the application as submitted. Lewis seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote.
4. 53 N. Second Street, house, Queen Anne, built between 1891 and 1894, AHI 85010. Lewis Lissner appeared in support of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. A wooden fence will be constructed between the house and the garage on the Garfield Avenue side of the property, and from the front porch to the lot line setback along the Second Street side. The fence will continue along the south lot line setback to the rear of the yard to meet an existing fence on the west side of the property. . The fences will be of the shadow box style, 6 feet in height, to enhance backyard pool safety and security. Koser moved to approve the application as submitted. Decker seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote.
5. 34 N. Madison Street, Dr. E.W. Beebe House, 1874 Second Empire, Benjamin S. Hoxie, builder, AHI 67428. Gary Haefer appeared in support of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deteriorated cedar shake shingles (shown by historical photos not to be original construction) will be replaced by factory-finished metal panels with slate shingle appearance. Deteriorated garage doors on the carriage house will be replaced with factory-finished doors, and deteriorated portions of fence will be repaired with matching dog-ear wood pickets. Stephans moved to approve the application as submitted. Christens seconded. Approved by unanimous voice vote.
6. 15 N. Second Street, house, Side Gabled, built between 1899 and 1907, AHI 85002. Steve Christens recused himself from the Commission and appeared in support of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Shingles on the garage will be replaced by shingles matching those on the house and the front porch will be repaired as follows: deck boards and skirting will be repaired with matching materials and a wooden railing will be applied at the same location as the original, which is now missing, but its prior location is shown by physical evidence. Ahner moved to approve the application as submitted. Koser seconded. Approved by voice vote with Christens abstaining.
7. 112 W. Liberty Street, Stephen J. Baker House, Gabled Ell, built between 1878 and 1883, AHI 85087. John Decker recused himself from the Commission and appeared in support of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. The deteriorated chimney on the rear of the portion of the house running parallel to the street will be removed per masonry contractor’s recommendation. To facilitate handicapped accessibility, a concrete stoop and wood door on the rear façade of the kitchen addition will be removed and will be replaced by a ramp and 36” door at a new location on the rear façade. A lean-to powder room addition on the rear facade will be increased in size from 6’1” x 3’6” to 6’1” x 7’1”, with removal of one window. Existing transite siding will be retained and used for patching where practicable, but replacement siding otherwise will be fiber cement board clapboards. Shutters, which are not original, will be removed. Koser moved to approve the application as submitted. Stephans seconded. Approved by voice vote with Decker abstaining.

 **Old business.** None presented.

 **Report of the Community Development Director**

1. **Staff issued Certificates of Appropriateness.** Sergeant reported that he had approved issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness for roofing projects at 122 W. Liberty Street and at 402 S. First Street, in consultation with Chairman Culbertson.
2. **Summary of applications.** Sergeant summarized the applications made to date in 2016 and their disposition.

**Correspondence, comments, and concerns.** None presented.

**Adjournment.**

Koser moved to adjourn. Ahner seconded. Approved by voice vote at 7:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

John Decker

Secretary

The minutes of the Evansville Historic Preservation Commission are not official until approved by the Commission.